Featured Reviews

Christian Buchet –
The Sea in History Quartet

In March 2012, Océanides, a five-year-old research entity, was established with the objective of providing scientific evidence of the role of maritime affairs in political, military, economic and cultural dimensions and, most particularly, as a driver of history and as a porthole into the globe’s future. Achieving this objective involved an overview of maritime history over the past five millennia. Océanides is based in Paris, with the independent Scientific Committee, chaired by Christian Buchet, presiding over the work of no less than 260 scholars from forty countries. Buchet is a professor of history and Director of CETMER Maritime Studies Centre at the Catholic University of Paris. The five years mandated by Océanides to do its work was indeed required with the Boydell Press publishing in 2017 a set of four volumes with the overarching title of “The Sea in History”. The set included a volume on Ancient, Medieval, Early Modern and the Modern World periods, with the declared ambition of replicating the aim of the Enlightenment’s first Encyclopaedists of the mid-eighteenth century. The objective of Denis Diderot and his stable of contributors in Paris at that time was to craft a compendium of the world’s knowledge in a single set of volumes for the benefit of humankind. A similar lofty aim is present here, albeit with full acknowledgement that only a soupçon of that history can be explored in a mere four volumes of short essays. The rationale for this endeavour is, of course, the assumption that the maritime dimension of history is oft overlooked in favour of a traditional, terrestrial bias and either the downplaying or ignoring the influence of the sea in the conduct of human affairs.

The Northern Mariner / Le marin du nord, XXX, No. 1 (Spring 2020), 55-66
What follows this brief introductory note, is the four reviews of the individual volumes of the set by three different reviewers (I completed two—the bookend volumes addressing the Ancient and Modern World, with Romney David Smith doing the volume on the Medieval period, and Margaret Schotte exploring the Early Modern volume). Of interest is that the reaction embodied in all the reviews is that the effort has been commendable, albeit uneven, and that inevitably there are gaps and omissions. All noted the lack of an index or bibliography (outside the inconsistent provision of footnotes), and all noted the rather hefty price tag (each volume is priced at $220 US) making it essentially unaffordable for any casual buyer who might wish to dip into the offerings from a wide range of scholars in each separate period. Yet, all also noted that there is much of interest and value in the books notwithstanding the reservations, with one, Smith, arguing that the set absolutely should be in any serious scholarly library.

In general, there are some common observations that can be made here. First, despite the global pretensions of the project, the bulk of the scholars and the bulk of the material is weighted to Europe and its intersections with the sea throughout history. Of the 40 countries that have provided scholars, Europe has contributed 22, with the heirs of Europe a further four (e.g., United States, Canada). Africa has provided six, Asia five and Latin America three. The absence of Micronesia is surprising, given the epic nature of Polynesian voyaging, and peopling of the Pacific islands, and the relative lack of Asian scholars’ unfortunate given the prominence of that vast region on global history. In contrast, discourse on the Mediterranean world is significantly overrepresented. The influence of Fernand Braudel looms over the entire effort as is perhaps inevitable, given his pioneering work a generation ago on *la longue durée* and the vital role of societies, geography and the sea to any understanding of history. While not directly intended by the general editor and his individual volume colleagues, there is more than a hint of homage to this highly influential French historian.

The second point to make is that while devotees of maritime history can be counted on to grumble at the relative lack of interest in their specialty amongst their peers, there has been a recent flowering of general, global histories on the subject. Notable amongst these are David Abulafia’s *The Boundless Sea: A Human History of the Oceans* (London, 2019); Lincoln Paine’s *The Sea and Civilization* (New York, 2013); and, Barry Cunliffe’s *On the Ocean: The Mediterranean and the Atlantic from Prehistory to AD 1500* (Oxford, 2017). The first, of course, postdates Buchet’s volumes, but all serve to illustrate that there is activity in the maritime history world that goes well beyond narrow national narratives.

A third point is the lack of unity to the essays incorporated into each volume. Individually, the essays have their audience, but there is a lack of glue between them that fails to bring the topics addressed together. The introductory and concluding essays in each volume attempt to do this, but the eclectic nature of the material provided argues against any overarching theme, save for the link to the world’s oceans. This is partly deliberate in that the sheer range of topics inherent in the global exploration of maritime history is an objective that was fostered by Buchet
and his sub-editors. Whether this approach to the essays works for individual readers is a matter of taste, but the scope inherent in each volume is such that most will only find a few of compelling interest. The general histories touched on above do not suffer from this difficulty as a single author provides the unity and theme as an essential element to their work.

Buchet’s summary is a relatively extensive paper—more than twice the average length of the papers included in the four volumes—that expounds on three key findings inherent in the entire project. The first is the claim that maritime factors are the most significant influence on political and economic development of individual states, a powerful force that leads to predominance and drives expansion and is consequently a primary driver of history. For practitioners of maritime history, broadly defined, this conclusion can certainly bring comfort to what might be perceived as a somewhat unfashionable corner of the profession. There is, thus, much to agree with in the sum of the papers that underscores this relationship between humankind and the seas. But it may be more correct to observe that all human endeavour is driven by a myriad of influences, working together in complex ways that makes causality inherently difficult to determine and nearly always contingent on further reflection, analysis and new evidence. Surely that is what makes the profession of history such a fascinating and compelling field of study.

From a Canadian perspective, this series is a powerful reminder of the role of the sea, of commerce, of naval power, and of our own reliance on maritime trade. Buchet may well have been considering the general ‘sea blindness’ of Canadians and their government as he set about to rectify matters with this set of volumes on ‘The Sea in History’. Anything that can encourage young scholars’ understandings of these broader matters and to open eyes to worlds far from home yet with significant influence on local prosperity is to be welcomed. Buchet’s work accomplishes this aim without doubt to those willing to dip into these volumes and seek to learn, to reflect and increase their understanding of the globe which we all inhabit.

Ian Yeates
Regina, Saskatchewan


This is the first of four volumes that address the question posed by General Editor, Christian Buchet,
as to whether the sea is the differentiating factor in the overall development of states, of societies and of history. The sea itself is a broad term essentially involving any activities and relationships with bodies of water be they rivers, lakes, seas or oceans. In particular, are the histories of those societies that took to the water different from those who shunned it, or from those geographically isolated from the sea? This is as wide a field of enquiry as one could possibly imagine and the range of approach provided by the contributors to this volume is indeed extremely diverse.

To ensure a degree of intellectual diversity, Buchet has organized a large group of historians from, he claims, around the world, to address particular issues from a variety of vantage points and different disciplines. This particular volume boasts no less than 42 articles written by 43 authors (one article is a collaboration of two historians) as well as separate papers by the volume’s editor to provide introductory and concluding bookends. It must be conceded, however, that the geographical dispersal of the historians represented in this volume is overwhelmingly European. No less than 15 are French, with six from the United States representing the second largest national contingent. Most of the rest are from the major European countries—Spain, Italy, Germany, UK, and Ireland—with one or two representatives from Africa, Asia and Latin America. The two historians from Asia are European in background who happen to be faculty at a Japanese and Singaporean university respectively. The diversity in perspective is therefore a little less than ideal in terms of fully achieving the objectives established by Buchet and reflects more the Western tradition.

The papers themselves vary widely in terms of topic, with the book split into two basic sections addressing prehistory—essentially interpreting evidence from archeology—and historical periods. The latter is geographically divided into standard areas of study and includes the Ancient Near East and Pharaonic Egypt; the Mediterranean World (the bulk of the book with 23 articles); and, the Indian Ocean and the Far East. Most of the papers are less than 15 pages in length, with the exceptions being an introductory paper by Pascal Picq, that posits the notion that “La mer est la propre d’Homo sapiens” and a concluding paper by one of the volume’s editors, Pascal Arnaud. As the title of Picq’s paper implies, it and a substantial proportion of the papers are in French. These 17 papers represent nearly half of the volume, which in of itself is not a problem for many, but is something to be aware of. No other languages are represented notwithstanding the nationalities of the historians involved.

The individual papers address subjects as widely separated as the prehistory of seafaring in the Caribbean and Japanese islands to the importance of the Euphrates and Tigris rivers in Mesopotamia where humankind’s first cities arose some six thousand years ago, to a number of papers on the maritime dimensions of the Greek and Roman states in the ancient world. One paper addresses the question of taxing maritime activities, which serves as a reminder that offshore tax havens are no new innovation. There are inevitably gaps in what is covered in the volume. There is, for example, no separate exploration of the role of Carthage in the Mediterranean
world, with some references provided through the Roman lens. Nor is there much on the scene in Africa south of the Mediterranean littoral, or of Latin America. If nothing else, such gaps demonstrate the difficulty in fitting in every topic that could be addressed in a single volume as well as impressing on the reader the broad orbit of the subject with what has been included.

Arnaud in his general introduction acknowledges this problem and admits that antiquity as an epoch is not well defined. In the Western tradition, the ancient world was that of the Mediterranean and the near East. The entities that strove for dominance as well as trade with each other form the bedrock of European civilization, and this reality is reflected in the fact that the three-quarters of the articles address issues in the Mediterranean basin. Civilizations further afield were legendary or only vaguely known to exist—knowledge essentially due to trade by very small enterprises—or were entirely unknown, such as the Americas and Australia. These significant limits do not render the effort at creating a global history nugatory and many of the papers will be of interest to both the specialist and general reader.

There are three caveats to note with this book. The first is the lack of an index to help locate material within the many papers that are linked. An index is an important aid to the reader of any academic text and this is no exception. Its lack is unfortunate. The second is that references, almost all secondary in nature, are often provided only as footnotes. It would have been helpful to have a bibliography at the end of each paper. Finally, the cost at US $220 is undeniably steep. Few will be willing to lay out such a sum, particularly if only a few articles are of immediate interest, and hence it likely will be a matter for libraries.

Ian Yeates
Regina, Saskatchewan


This intimidating volume represents the second in a set of four, following on The Sea in History - The Ancient World, and preceding two more books on the early modern and modern eras. The book’s editor, Michel Balard, wastes no time in invoking Braudel in his introduction, which serves as a
clear enough signpost to what follows. And what follows is interesting, diverse, and often exciting. Even 75 papers in French and English and over a thousand pages, however, can hardly do justice to a subject that spans a millennium and—more ambitiously—the entire world. The book embraces “Universal History,” as the editor puts it, seeking to identify how the sea was a “differentiating factor in world history.” It is a tall order, and one cannot envy the editor his job of herding so many scholars, themselves distributed across 40 countries, including the Caribbean, Mali, Korea, the Mongol Empire, Indonesia and elsewhere. Despite that geographical spread, the total regional distribution of the chapters does not stray that far from the traditional haunts of medieval studies. Of the 75 entries, 31 deal with some aspect of the Mediterranean (including the Black Sea), with 10 focussing on Venice and Genoa alone. Another 14 cover the North Atlantic, North Sea and Scandinavia. This leaves little room for the Americas, where we have two papers on the Mayans and one on the Andean coast of South America. The Indian Ocean is better served with seven papers, and the Far East with six. The remaining chapters are broader studies, which tend to focus on European examples, such as Nikolas Jaspert’s look at the link between piracy and state power, while a handful of authors travel even further afield, to Senegal, or to the Philippines.

A book like this faces a challenge: to cover the bases implied in its title, or to provide new offerings and fresh scholarship. The Sea in History attempts to satisfy both requirements, with mixed results. Some contributors offer new insights, such as Gertwagen’s insightful reflections on the sheer incompetence of the Venetian navy, and Gregor Rohmann on the Vitalian Brethen in the Baltic. Two engaging chapters, by Gerassimos Pagratis and Nevra Necipoğlu, contest the traditional view of Byzantines as antipathetic to the sea. Other contributors, however, provide straightforward surveys of their subjects, as in Sachin Pendse’s paper on shipbuilding in India and Jorge Ortiz-Sotelo’s overview of “Central Andean Peoples and their Relationship to the Sea.” Some of these feel more necessary than others: with a surfeit of books on the Vikings available, do we need a new 14-page overview of the Viking ship, no matter how well written? One senses the intention to cover all the bases, but of course there are omissions. The absence of Polynesia is surprising; likewise, except for a section on Spain, the Islamic Mediterranean during its so-called “Golden Age” before the crusades is entirely absent. And while Angela Schottenhammer provides a useful overview of “Maritime Relations between the Indian Ocean and China in the Middle Ages,” the intervening territory of mainland South-East Asia doesn’t merit a single article.

Meanwhile, for the ever popular city of Venice, we learn about the culture and conditions of sailors in Doris Stöckly’s paper, Jean-Claude Hocquet explains the vital role of salt in the commune’s economy, Bernard Doumerc outlines different logistical approaches to Venetian seafaring, Elisabeth Crouzet-Pavan describes the expansion of the arsenal over the centuries, while John E. Dotson addresses the shipbuilders and Ruthy Gertwagen offers an admirable overview of the “Naval Power of Venice in the Eastern Mediterranean.” At the other end of the world, of
six sections dealing with the Far East, two full papers and part of another focus on the few decades of the early-fifteenth century in which the treasure ships sailed under Zheng He.

In short, coverage is uneven and sometimes arbitrary. Guided by the ghost of Braudel (and Horden and Purcell), most of the authors make an attempt at the *longe durée*. The papers mostly eschew historical personages in favour of durations, which are usually measured in centuries. But the comparative project suggested by the editor of the sea as a “differentiating factor in world history” is not made explicit, as each paper by necessity confines itself within one region or subject area (already big enough in most cases). Drawing out the comparisons is left to the reader, a task that is eased by the predominance of certain themes. Chief among them is shipbuilding. Individual articles cover the topic in the Adriatic, Venice, Portugal, Byzantine Constantinople, Viking Scandinavia, India, and the Philippines, while others address it more lightly in Al-Andalus, the Kingdom of Jerusalem, knightly Rhodes, Lusignan Cyprus, Crete, England, Yuan China, and Korea. Any specialist in naval technology will be well served by this book. A second key theme is naval organization and state sponsorship of fleets and maritime expansion, and here too the offerings span the globe.

This book is, quite simply, too big. There is a nice volume here on Venice and Genoa, another on the medieval Baltic and North Sea, a third and slighter one on China and the Indian Ocean. Taken together, they are difficult to deal with. It is not clear for whom this book is intended. Its diversity makes it a fun read; this reader had never before considered the navigational problems faced by the early Maya, or the balsa rafts of the Peruvian coast. But nobody buys a book at this price for its entertainment value. Specialists in the history of shipbuilding, nautical technology, or naval organization will have reason to consult it, and those pursuing cross-cultural approaches to these subjects may find it very valuable indeed. A comparative approach to the various maritime histories of the world is a desirable outcome, which this book fosters, and it may be recommended on that basis. I would certainly hope to find it in any library or collection devoted to naval or maritime studies.

Romney David Smith
London, Ontario

Christian Buchet and Gérard Le Bouëdec (eds.)
The Sea in History: The Early Modern World – La mer dans l’histoire: La Période Moderne.
“How did the sea modify the course of history?” Like the Enlightenment’s famed *Encyclopédie*, this ambitious four-volume work produced by the Océanides project aims to catalogue and explain the entirety of humankind’s interaction with nature—a Universal History viewed through a maritime lens (xxv). In *The Sea in History* an international and interdisciplinary group of 260 senior academics seek to identify—and quantify as far as possible—“what developments can be attributed to the sea, both in general history and in ... political entities?” (xxiii). The illustrious team explores the economic, technological, and political effects of maritime activity around the globe. Like the Enlightenment philosophes, the work is impressive and field-defining, although ultimately certain aspects of maritime influence remain impossible to measure.

This volume was edited by Gérard Le Bouëdec, Emeritus Professor of the University of South Brittany, and Christian Buchet, Professor of Maritime History at Catholic University of Paris, and Scientific Director of the five-year Océanides enterprise. The bilingual volume contains 42 chapters in French and 33 in English. Both front- and end-matter usefully appears in both languages. The conclusion, by Le Bouëdec, largely recaps the contents of each chapter, while Buchet’s General Conclusion (repeated in each of the four volumes) lays out the project’s overarching claims, which relate primarily to trade.

The third volume is dedicated to “the early modern world,” the late fifteenth century to the conclusion of the Napoleonic Wars. By choosing to begin with the “1488-1492 geographic ‘big bang’” (1039), the editors acknowledge the significance of the Portuguese Pedro Dias rounding the southern tip of Africa into the Indian Ocean, a navigational milestone equal or greater than Columbus sailing to the Caribbean. Indeed the volume places more emphasis on the Indian and Pacific Oceans than on the Atlantic. In this “early modern” volume (*moderne* in French), there is considerable focus on the developments of the eighteenth century—many of the authors look ahead to industrialization. (Readers interested in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries may find pertinent material in the second, “medieval” volume.)

Even in a project as international as this one, western Europe receives the most attention, particularly Great Britain, the Netherlands, and France. There are, however, illuminating case studies of less prominent maritime entities, including the Hanseatic league, Sweden, Russia, and the Habsburgs. The editors made concerted efforts to construct a global project, including novel work on Indonesia (M.-S. de Vienne, A. Ota), Peru (J. Ortiz-Sotelo), and the Maratha Empire of India (S. Pendse). If only a small proportion of the chapters discuss extra-European regions (seven focus on parts of Africa, four on India, eleven on Asia), there is considerable benefit to presenting these studies alongside more familiar cases. These global examples make eminently clear that financial innovation, political calculations, and labour issues were not unique to European maritime actors.

Economic questions tie together the contributions. Many chapters trace the expansion of trade in specific commodities, with salt and wine receiving as much
analysis as the slave trade (the former treated in chapters by I. Amorim and A. Wegener Sleeswijk, the latter by D. Eltis and O. Grenouilleau). We are told that coastal communities progress up a hierarchy of maritime activity: from fishing to trade, which in turn leads to the development a navy (1027). The sea can act at considerable distance, shaping the agriculture of the coastal hinterlands. And yet certain claims are heavy-handed: do “maritime capitals” (in contrast to “land-based capitals”) develop their demographic and economic wealth solely due to their location? Buchet contends that “The lesson is clear: political entities that turn towards the sea think in terms of flows, exchanges and openness, all drivers of economic development” (1018). Surely such priorities are not limited to coastal cities.

Similarly, the research agenda presuppose that maritime benefits can be quantified (“what additional advantages did the sea provide to the groups that engaged in maritime activities?” xxiv). By posing questions in this way, polities chosen as intriguing counter-examples (Central Europe by O. Chaline, Safavid Persia by C. Poirier-Coutansais) become straw men, quickly dismissed for their “inability to rule the waves” (966). The project as a whole offers a useful corrective to those histories that overlook the maritime context, but as is the case when carpenters encounter nothing but nails, to these economic maritime historians, it seems that everything develops because of the sea.

Overall the project succeeds at its broad goals, providing a wealth of detail about the connections between state and merchant, pirate and port, not just in Europe but around the world. Readers may, however, wish for social and cultural approaches to this material. Sailors appear as statistics rather than individuals. A lone chapter by F. Bellec discusses the impact of maritime “discoveries” on literature and art, while medicine and science are each discussed in just a single chapter (M. Harrison, L. Ferreiro).

The decision to publish a dual-language work leads to occasional awkward translations (structuration, “Insulindia” for maritime southeast Asia). The absence of a comprehensive index and bibliography is regrettable. Fortunately, the footnotes of individual chapters offer a trove of multilingual sources, and are one of the strengths of this collection.

Although the price of the four-volume set is prohibitive for general readers, the breadth of material in this volume will make it a valuable addition to specialized libraries.

In their efforts to quantify and analyze the effect of oceans on global trade, Buchet, Le Bouëdec and the Océanides team have produced an admirable modern-day Encyclopédie of the sea.

Margaret Schotte
Toronto, Ontario
This is the fourth volume in a set that previously addressed the same question implied in the title with respect to the Ancient, the Medieval, and the Early Modern worlds. This final volume of the four covers the late-nineteenth century to the present day, and seeks to tackle the question of whether the sea is a differentiating factor in world history and what advantages, if any, did the sea provide to those who engaged in maritime activities. The objective, in brief, is to re-examine universal or global history through the maritime lens. Importantly, the scholarship embedded in this volume (and the series), is to bring together disparate disciplines that otherwise might not intersect given the tendency of the historical profession to specialisation and isolation. The Western world’s approach to analysis, assumptions, and common perspectives has in this work specifically been nuanced by differing views from around the globe so as to provide balance and universality. The importance of the sea, according to Buchet in his introduction, is that it is the key to history, the thread that links the globe together and permits insights that explains our contemporary geopolitical scene.

Accomplishing this enormous task has involved no less than 260 researchers from all historical disciplines that have addressed a multitude of perspectives on this ambitious endeavour, with some 68 involved in this particular volume. The ambition of the series is vast. Buchet, in his introduction, indicates that the range and scope of the topics addressed by the individual contributors has its antecedents from no less an endeavour than that of the writers of the first Encyclopædia in the eighteenth century. Notwithstanding this notional pedigree, the focus has been on research over the past decade-and-a-half, say from the turn of the present century. Indeed, this period, and arguably a good decade prior, has witnessed a sea change in approach to maritime history from one of battles, of biography, of exploration, of war to a more comprehensive analysis of finance, of economics, of trade, of maritime societies and the broader societies from which they sprung, of ports, of shipbuilding, of navigation, of hydrography, of gender and of race. Consequently, this series of impressive volumes is timely given trends in recent scholarship.

N.A.M. Rodger in his introduction to this fourth volume in the series, in support of the theme, notes that the contributors were tasked not with delving into new research but rather to answer the question “what difference did the sea make?” in their fields of expertise. The intent is a broader consideration of the contributors’
subject than is typically provided in conventional scholarship. Rodger concedes
the underlying assumption that the sea indeed matters, but the expectation of a
more reflective examination of various topics will generate the unity sought in
the book notwithstanding the broad range of expertise represented by the many
scholars involved.

The essays in the book are short, most in the range of 10-15 pages. The
individual scholars are largely from the Western tradition and represent a wide
range of European and North American historians, including luminaries such
as Paul Kennedy, Andrew Lambert, John Beeler, Jon Sumida, Avner Offer,
Christopher Bell, Norman Friedman, Jeremy Black and many others. Scholars
outside the English-speaking world include Gunnar Åselius, Anita M.C. van
Dissel, Francesco Zampieri, Jesús M. Valdaliso, Anders Mønrad Moller, Yoichi
Hirama to name but a few. Most of the essays are written in English, but there is a
significant minority in French. In a short review of this nature, it is neither fair nor
feasible to examine meaningfully the individual articles. It can be noted, however,
that the brevity of the essays has obliged the contributors to focus their thinking
and deliver their insights within a small compass. By and large, the scholars have
accomplished their objectives. Rodgers concludes the volume with a contribution
of his own to sum up what has been provided and to offer his own thoughts on
the relevance of the sea to history. Buchet then summarises the series in a similar
fashion. All the introductory and concluding essays provided by the editors are in
both French and English.

Does this particular volume deliver on its promise? I think it does so very
well. The opportunity to bring together such a wide range of scholars to consider
a single premise as it relates to their areas of expertise is rare. As the question
posed (does the sea matter?) is broad it permits a response across an equally broad
range of scholarship. The conclusion is that the sea indeed matters—Buchet notes
that it has accelerated political and economic development, it has driven political
dominance and expansion, and it has driven history in general terms—all of which
is evident in these essays. Importantly, the volume illustrates the richness and
strength of maritime history in relation to the general subject of history where it
has languished as a forgotten or, perhaps worse, as an antiquarian pursuit of little
relevance or interest to ‘real’ historians. That cavil has never been right and this
book (and series) demonstrates the vibrancy, range and depth of maritime history
well.

Four criticisms. First, it is a pity that scholars from Asia are not represented.
Asia certainly features in a number of the essays, but there are no scholars from
China or India and but one from Japan. The same can be said for Africa and
Latin America. Consequently, there exist gaps in perspective that are important to
the very subject of global history. Perhaps this is inevitable with the logistics of
corralling such a range of scholars being overwhelming. Second, the book lacks
an index. This is unfortunate as there is significant difficulty in finding nuggets
of information scattered amongst the papers. The third is the uneven provision of
footnotes and bibliographies for the individual papers. This complicates efforts to
follow up on ideas or conclusions reached in the paper. This point is not applicable to all papers and some have the normal academic apparatus. The absence of same in a fair number of cases is unfortunate. The fourth is that the book is quite expensive. At $220 US the price will be well beyond ordinary budgets, which is most unfortunate. Nevertheless, if one is prepared to swallow the cost, the reward of dipping into the various essays provided by this collection of top-notch scholars and writers is well worth it.

Ian Yeates
Regina, Saskatchewan